

197

Social dialogue in welfare services (Sowell)

Case study report Denmark

Nana Wesley Hansen, Mikkel Mailand and Frida Lilli Schlanbusch Nørkjær

December 2022

ISBN 978-87-93320-65-9

Employment Relations
Research Centre

Department of Sociology
University of Copenhagen
Øster Farimagsgade 5
DK-1014 Copenhagen K
Tel: +45 35323299
Fax: +45 35323940
faos@sociology.ku.dk
www.faos.dk



Contents

1. Introduction	3
2. LTC case: Recruitment and vocational education in Herning municipality	4
2.1 The local context	4
2.2 The case study issue and problems to be solved	4
2.3 The actors involved	5
2.4 The processes and solutions	6
2.5 Implementation.....	8
2.6 Results and effects so far	9
3. LTC case: Project Erantis, Ikast-Brande municipality	10
3.1 The local context	10
3.2 The case study issue and problems to be solved	10
3.3 The actors involved	11
3.4 The processes and solutions	11
3.5 Implementation.....	12
3.6 Results and effects so far	12
4. ECEC case: Recruitment and retention initiatives in the City of Copenhagen.....	15
4.1 The local context	15
4.2 The case study and problems to be solved	15
4.3 Actors involved and their positions	15
4.4 The process and result	16
4.5 Discussion and evaluation	16
5. ECEC case: Experimenting to improve service quality in day care in Elsinore municipality	18
5.1 The local context	18
5.2 The case study and problems to be resolved	18
5.3 The actors involved	19
5.4 The process.....	19
5.5 The results and evaluation	20
6. Comparing the four cases – what to learn from them?.....	22
6.1 The content of cases	22
6.2 The budgetary context for the cases	23
6.3 Actors, arenas and influence.....	23
6.4 Governance.....	24
6.5 Learning across cases	25
References	27
Annex A – List of interviewees	28

1. Introduction

This is a report on the Danish case study in the project ‘Social dialogue in welfare services – employment relations, labour market and social actors in the care services’ (SOWELL).

The guidelines for the case study (Work Package 3) project include, first, that they should address the main challenges found in the sector-wide studies (WP1/WP2). In the Danish case, recruitment problems could be seen as the main challenges, but workload/work intensification and service quality were also shown to cause much concern.

Second, with regard to the status of the cases, the guidelines for case selection prescribe that they can be innovative and/or be characterized as experimentations. However, practices that are not innovative but which ‘work well’ in a given context can also be included if they contribute to solving a problem. The extent to which practices from the case could be adopted in other local contexts and situations could also be taken into consideration.

During spring 2022, a combination of contacts via WP1/WP2 interviewees and snowballing was used in attempts to get access potential cases. Localizing appropriate cases and getting some of these to sign up to the project turned out to be more difficult and time-consuming than expected, especially in the long-time care (LTC) sector.

The four Danish local cases – two from LTC and two from the Early Childhood Education and Care (ECEC) sector – all focus in various ways on recruitment (and retention) of employees, but also relate to the quadrilemma dimensions of job quality (including wages and work intensification/work organization) and service quality. Five interviews were conducted in each of the cases (see Annex A), and various written materials (reports, pamphlets, notices of meetings, etc.) were collected.

All four cases were ongoing at the time the interviews were conducted (May–July 2022). The advantages of this were that the interviewees were asked about processes that were either ongoing or very recent. This improved the reliability of the information provided. The drawback was that none of the projects had been through a final evaluation, and their degree of success and learning potential were therefore uncertain.

The SOWELL project is funded by the European Commission’s General Directorate for Employment (agreement number VS/2020/0242) and is coordinated by University of Milan. The project was conducted during the period January 2020–December 2022 and covered the following EU member states: Denmark, Germany, Hungary, Italy, the Netherlands, Slovenia and Spain.

2. LTC case: Recruitment and vocational education in Herning municipality

This case was selected because it potentially included innovative actions regarding recruitment (and retention) of staff in eldercare, but also because it addressed another important recruitment dimension, namely, the recruitment and retention of students to the relevant educations.

2.1 The local context

Herning municipality is a medium-sized rural/urban Danish municipality with 89,000 inhabitants (1.5% of the Danish population), situated in the central part of Jutland. Historically, the city experienced rapid growth in the second half of the 19th century based on its central position in Jutland's railway network and, especially, the development of a strong textile and garment industry. However, the industry went into decline in the 1970s, and although traces of its glorious past can still be seen in the industrial structure, the strongholds are now IT, commerce, various forms of private services and activities related to the city's status as a hub – commercial fairs, conferences, sports events and entertainment shows (trap.lex.dk). Moreover, the municipality has a strong educational profile with several vocational schools. Politically, the municipality has for a long time been dominated by The Liberal Party of Denmark.

2.2 The case study issue and problems to be solved

The case is divided into two partly interwoven initiatives, both funded by the municipality with no subsidies from national funds. The two initiatives do not exclusively target elder care, but the elder care area is the largest area covered. Herning municipality has around 1,000 SOSU employees (social and health care assistants/helpers), but the problem of recruiting sufficient SOSU staff – as described in the WP1/WP2 report – is also found in Herning municipality, where 15% of staff now are unskilled (10% in nursing homes and 20% in homecare) according to one of the interviewees. This difference reflects the fact that it is more difficult to recruit skilled home-helpers than skilled SOSU staff in nursing homes. Both figures are considered too high by the interviewees. Prior to 2017, the municipality only used unskilled staff as temps during holiday periods. The municipality has tried to motivate the unskilled to complete formal education.

According to the interviewees, the recruitment problems in the social and health area are less severe in this part of the country than in Denmark in general – and this is supported by official statistics (STAR 2022). However, during the last three to four years, recruitment problems and a reduction in the number of students commencing SOSU education have gradually increased, and this is also the case in Herning municipality.

The first (broader) initiative is Herning municipality's 'Strategy for recruitment of SOSU personnel for Health and Elderly towards 2030' (Herning kommune 2019), launched in 2019. It has a relatively broad scope in that it includes no less than with five intervention areas: foreign labour; sector

mobility; high-quality study environment; employment of SOSU students in Herning municipality; and challenges for senior employees.

The second (more focused) initiative is Herning municipality's joint strategy with five neighbouring municipalities and the SOSU vocational school in Herning, named 'Recruitment and retention of students in social and health educations' (Social og Sundhedsskolen Herning et al.). This strategy, which includes three guidelines ('referencepunkter') and a 'joint quality agreement' was formulated in the autumn of 2019 with implementation planned for 2020–22.

Both initiatives have a focus on recruitment of SOSU staff. However, the 'Towards 2030' strategy directly targets recruitment and retention of skilled staff, whereas the 'education strategy' targets the recruitment and retention of students. Moreover, 'Towards 2030' also focuses on the work environment and labour migration, as the five intervention areas illustrate.

Table 2.1 An overview of the two initiatives within the case

<p><i>Strategy for recruitment of SOSU personnel for Health and Elderly towards 2030</i></p> <p>This initiative covers five intervention areas; each includes a number of experiments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Foreign labour (incl. experiments and 'Well on the way to SOSU') - Sector mobility - High quality study environment - Employment of SOSU students in Herning municipality during Basic Period 2 - Late carrier
<p><i>Recruitment and retention of students in social and health educations</i></p> <p>This initiative includes three guidelines and a joint quality agreement:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - We all facilitate education everywhere - We improve the coherence between school and practical training - We tell the good story together - Joint quality agreement

2.3 The actors involved

Both initiatives in this case include several actors. In 'Towards 2030', Herning municipality is the main actor. The municipality has a role both as employer and as public authority. Different parts of the administration are involved, but the core department is the Health and Elderly department. Moreover, the Integration department is involved in at least one of the five intervention areas, and the HR department has a role to play in most of them. The SOSU school is an important actor in several of the intervention areas too, and the municipal Job Centre is involved in some of the initiatives. Finally, there are several paths for trade union involvement in the initiative as will be illustrated below. However, as a transversal body, the bipartite Cooperation Council has been involved in the initiative as well as in several of its intervention areas at the overarching level. In addition to these actors, others have played roles in demarcated parts of single intervention areas, such as an agricultural knowledge centre and a recruitment bureau in foreign labour.

In the ‘educational strategy’, the SOSU school Herning could be considered the main actor, but the six municipalities are also important and act both as public authorities and as employers for the students who obtain practical training places in the municipalities. Also in this initiative, FOA has a role to play. A number of other actors have minor roles, which will be described below.

The most relevant local trade union in both the initiatives covered in the case is FOA, although the Danish Nurses Organization (DNO) is also involved. The local branch FOA Midt- og Vestjylland was created by the amalgamation of FOA Herning and FOA Holsterbro in April 2022.

2.4 The processes and solutions

2.4.1 Towards 2030

‘Towards 2030’, as mentioned above, includes five intervention areas.

1) ‘*Foreign labour*’ seems to have drawn most political attention (from the city council). It aims to attract non-Danish citizens – both persons with residence in Denmark/the municipality and persons with residence abroad – by analysing the factors that make it attractive to stay in the municipality and by removing barriers for integration. In this intervention area various experiments (‘*prøvehandler*’) have taken place, following several tracks. One has focused on recruitment of the spouses of male agricultural workers, especially from Easter Europe and Germany, though targeted actions in Spain are also under consideration. The task of finding potential foreign workers, at the beginning of the process, was in the hands of a Danish agricultural consultancy firm, but the task was later passed to their job broker company. Another experiment is an educational programme in two parts for foreign workers; the first part has a major focus on language training and a minor focus on working in Danish nursing homes, while the second part includes SOSU courses and practical training with the aim of building a bridge to normal SOSU education. The participants are paid a wage corresponding to an unskilled SOSU worker wage.

This intervention area also includes ‘*Well on the way to SOSU*’, an approximately six-month action, comprised of practical training and vocational and language schooling, at the wage-level for unskilled SOSU workers. Twenty-seven participants with foreign backgrounds had completed the action in November 2021 (Herning kommune 2021).

One of the key challenges of the foreign workers intervention area is that it takes time to learn a new language that is very different from one’s native language. The project management considered using some kind of entrance criteria, such as the ability to speak English (thereby demonstrating the ability to learn a foreign language). Another challenge for this intervention area, according to some of the interviewees, is the high cost per foreign employee (170,000–270,000 euro), considering that there is no guarantee the experiment will lead to employment. A third challenge is that although the local branch of FOA and its shop stewards are generally described as cooperative by the other actors in relation to this intervention area, FOA has some reservations. The

union is concerned about workload in terms of the on-the-job training when the foreigners are not able to speak Danish. Moreover, FOA has rejected some proposals, for instance the creation of special trade unions clubs for foreign workers. FOA is also concerned about lacking Danish language skills and downward pressure on wages in connection with the use of foreign labour. This worry about downward pressure on wages (and on service quality) is also found in relation to the increasing use of unskilled SOSU employees more generally and so is not completely related to their status as native or foreign workers.

2) '*Sector mobility*'. This intervention aims at easing the transition into SOSU jobs for people in sectors with lower labour demands or who are unemployed. Cooperation with the job centre is key here, and municipal actors aim to make job centres aware of the opportunities in the SOSU sector. This includes a (higher) wage ('voksenelevløn/-lærligeløn') than the usual (lower) educational grant while in education for those who change sector. In this regard, a number of cooperation agreements have been made with the job centre. The FOA is also involved in this intervention area on an ad hoc basis, both to check for possible labour market regulation issues and to have an input on the development mobility in the sector.

3) '*High quality study environment*' is an intervention area that aims to clarify the roles of the different actors in the Herning SOSU school in order to create a coherent educational structure and mainstream the offers to students that – according to interviewees – were previously too uncoordinated. This intervention area dates back to 2019 and was planned as a way to reduce the drop-out rate from the school. After the implementation of the initiative, each workplace with SOSU students has a 'practical training supervisor', working above/across individual 'supervisors'. The practical training supervisor coordinates the interaction between the school and the students during practical training. Moreover, the experiment has allocated more time to the established supervisors.

4) '*Employment of SOSU students in Herning municipality during Basic Period 2*'. This intervention area was initiated in the middle of 2021 and directs that the student, regardless of their age, is paid a salary – not the lower student allowance – during the SOSU education Basic Period 2. (Basic Period 2 is a 20-week school-based part of the education, taking place after the general school-based introduction in Basic Period 1 and before the Main Period, which is in between further schooling and practical training, normally in real workplace environments.)

5) '*The challenges for senior employees*' (renamed '*Late carrier*') is basically about providing the best conditions for job retention of employees aged 60+. As elsewhere in Denmark, the average age of SOSU workers is high in Herning municipality. This intervention area includes guidance for discussions with senior employees; special development talks for all employees when they turn 60; and compulsory workshops for all senior staff. The guidance includes information about the various possibilities open to senior employees, e.g., the possibilities for unchanged pension savings, even if a senior employee chooses to work reduced hours (because the municipality bears the extra costs).

This intervention area has been developed in a cooperation between the Health and Elderly department, the HR department and the Cooperation Committee.

2.4.2 The 'educational strategy'

The educational strategy aims at reducing educational dropout rates. Although, according to the interviewees, the dropout rate at Herning SOSU School is below the national average, the 10–15% figure at the school reported in the interviews is considered too high.

The SOSU education is a so-called dual education, combining periods at the school with periods in a real work environment in the form of so-called practical training places (practical training periods).

The educational strategy includes, as mentioned, three guidelines. 'We all facilitate education everywhere' has a focus on what the student can expect from the practical training place. The aim is clearer expectations, better integration of students in the workplace and more focus on learning (including the possibility to leave the workplace to undertake courses) during the practical training period. 'We improve the coherence between school and practical training' includes actions such as visits and exchanges for employees at the school at the practical training place - and vice versa. 'We tell the good story together' focuses on lifting the status of the occupation through, e.g., coordinated marketing with the aim of attracting more qualified students.

After the educational strategy was formulated, the joint quality agreement was added. This focuses on the practical training placements. Its content centres on high level/high quality completed education; student well-being; the conditions for practical training of counsellors and for the vocational and personal development of students. It emphasizes the obligations of management at the workplace to offer the practical training place as well as those of the municipal educational consultant, and includes compulsory evaluation talks with the students. The joint quality agreement led to a more hands-on document, 'Roads to the good quality education – creates coherence between school and practical training'. This document was authored by the municipalities in cooperation with the SOSU School, the bipartite local educational committee (situated at the school), students, workplaces delivering practical training and the trade union FOA (Social- og Sundhedsskolen Herning et al. 2020).

2.5 Implementation

With regard to 'Towards 2030', the different intervention areas within the broad umbrella have been implemented at various times. Some of them included, as mentioned, pilot-like initiatives in the form of experiments, whereas others have not. Implementation of 'High quality student environment' started in January 2021, while 'Employment of SOSU students in Herning municipality during Basic Period 2' was implemented from mid-2021. When the interviews were conducted (June–July 2022) most of the five areas of action had already been implemented, whereas others were only implemented in the second half of 2022.

The ‘educational strategy’ was implemented from 2020 to 2022, and with differing speeds in the individual municipalities. At the time of the data collection, most parts of the initiative had been implemented.

2.6 Results and effects so far

For the most part, it is too early to evaluate the results of the initiatives. However, in some of the intervention areas there are some indicative results or preliminary evaluations given by the interviewees.

The attention, at both political and administrative levels, given in the municipalities to the ‘Foreign Workers’ intervention area has been high, and the initiative has led to recruitment of a (so far low) number of foreign workers. As the labour shortages issue spread during 2022, this part of ‘Towards 2030’ received national media attention (Altinget 14 August 2022). However, and as already mentioned, some of the interviewees found a weakness in the very high price/use of resources per foreign worker recruited. It remains to be seen if, in the near future, ‘Foreign workers’ will show a lower use of resources per foreign worker recruited.

According to interviewees, ‘Employment of SOSU students in Herning municipality during Basic Period 2’ seems to have increased the number of recruitments, but a final evaluation has not yet taken place.

Regarding ‘High quality study environment’ it remains a challenge that the students are not always getting all their planned supervision because of busy working days in the elder-care workplaces, according to one of the interviewees. There have even been reports of a substitution of supervisor hours with driving hours (to the elderly in private homes).

With regard to the ‘educational strategy’, its joint quality agreement will be evaluated in 2023.

Across the two initiatives and its many intervention areas, the SOSU workers have, according to the interviewees, generally received the activities well. However, according to some of the interviewees, there is a perception among staff in some workplaces of being burdened with too many new initiatives.

3. LTC case: Project Erantis, Ikast-Brande municipality

This case was selected due to its potentially innovative practices in relation to work organizations, which aim to improve both job quality and service quality as well as recruitment and retention of home-helpers.

3.1 The local context

Ikast-Brande municipality is a medium–small, mostly rural municipality with 42,000 inhabitants in the central part of Jutland. The municipality was created by fusing two municipalities in the 2007 reform of local and regional administrative structures in Denmark. Like Herning municipality, it has long been politically dominated by the Liberal Party. The municipality shares a border with Herning as well as industrial history. However, due to its smaller size it has not developed into a transport, event and education hub as its neighbour has.

Ikast-Brande is one of six municipalities that took part in the recruitment and vocational education case in Herning municipality, described and analysed above.

3.2 The case study issue and problems to be solved

The most important aims of project Erantis – via work reorganization and a focus on individual user needs – are to improve working conditions/work satisfaction as well as service quality/user satisfaction. The core part of the project is self-governing teams, a type of work organization that has been used extensively in parts of the manufacturing industry for decades, but is less widespread and less well known in the public sector. As elsewhere, elder care in Ikast-Brande municipality has been facing challenges such as work intensification and recruitment problems.

The project is financed by two nationwide funds set up to improve the care sector, and is sponsored by the Danish Health Authorities (within The Danish Ministry of Health) and the Danish Social Authorities (within the Ministry of Social Affairs and Senior Citizens), respectively.

The project is explicitly inspired by the Dutch so-called Buurtzorg ('local care') model, named after a Dutch private care provider which has had great success with its care services. Buurtzorg is an organization with a slim management structure, extensive self-governance for care workers and user innovations. The Buurtzorg model has inspired not only care work in Ikast-Brande municipality, but in several Danish municipalities, and it is currently the most refereed source of inspiration in Danish LTC. However, Ikast-Brande was the first Danish municipality to visit the Dutch NGO, and the first to build an initiative directly on the Dutch model.

The Buurtzorg method was first tested in a pilot project in two locations run by a private provider, Lokalepleje Danmark. The pilot project started in December 2019 and ended prematurely in August 2021. The project got a positive mid-term evaluation, but the provider went bankrupt in August 2021. According to one interviewee, the bankruptcy was caused by problems in providing a needed 24-hour service and approval of too many home help

applications. According to Lokalpleje Danmark itself, it was a combination of insufficient support from the municipality, too much control and the small scale of the project that led to financial difficulties (Horsens Folkeblad 21 September 2021).

3.3 The actors involved

The final decision to get the Erantis project up and running was political and taken by the city council. It is also the city council that has the competences to end the project. The Erantis project manager, a former manager for elder care and nursing care, is employed by the municipality. She took part in the development of the project and the application to the authorities before she was appointed manager.

The governance structure of Erantis includes four bodies:

- 1) The Steering Committee has contact with the city council and is responsible for general oversight of the project, including finances. The municipal Health and Elderly director chairs the committee; other members include the municipal Across Director¹ and a number of FOA and DNO shop stewards, who, according to interviewees, have been very interested in the project.
- 2) The Resource Group includes a number of managers from the municipal Health and Elderly department, who were able to verify whether proposed actions were in line with rules and regulations or if changes in the proposed actions were needed.
- 3) The 'Reference Group' has a more indirect role in Erantis. The group had, at the time of data collection, met six times and they had, moreover, participated in workshops. The group includes the municipality's Elder Council, as well as a number of trade unions and shop stewards. The role of the Reference Group is both to provide input from stakeholders and to inform the members about the project, because as core stakeholders they have a legitimate interest in being informed and consulted and in removing potential barriers.
- 4) The project management team, which also includes external consultants.

Besides these project-targeted bodies, Erantis is also frequently discussed in the formal bodies for employee involvement at the local level, i.e., the Cooperation Committees. Moreover, Ikast-Brandeburg municipality has exchanged information with two other municipalities in Jutland that also receive funding from the central authorities for Buurtzorg-inspired activities.

3.4 The processes and solutions

Phase 1 of Erantis – which can be seen as its development phase - started in May 2021 and ended in June 2022. It focused on four so-called 'learning circles', which are a tool for employee-driven innovation. Each circle included eight employees, most of whom were recruited by some of their nearest leaders. The learning circles have been focused on either 'self-governing integrated teams', 'the meeting between citizen and employee', 'coherence in the citizen process' and 'citizen-focused visitation process'. In each of the learning circles,

¹ The Across Director is a position only found in Ikast-Brandeburg municipality. The director works across and covers the areas of elderly, health, psychiatry, disabled and labour market.

a number of hands-on ‘experiments’ involving the employees has taken place. These experiments were subsequently evaluated and then either abandoned or developed further. According to one interview, the total sum of experiments has been around 50 and each has met roughly every second week. The experiments were the most important input into the recommendations (see below).

According to one interviewee, only employees who have participated in the learning circles feel they are part of Erantis. Those that have only been involved in the experiments do not feel part of the project. Two-thirds of the employees were involved in experiments during phase 1.

Phase 1 led to a number of recommendations to guide the next phase in the project. The recommendations can be summarised thus:

- Citizens should be met by the carers based on what is important for the citizen, and visits should include time for communication about this.
- Citizens in need should be met by cross-occupational rehabilitation teams.
- Cross-occupational, self-governing, geographically demarcated teams, ‘geo-teams’ should be established (see below)
- Geo-teams meet citizens in their homes and make plans according to the citizens’ needs.
- Citizens should meet few carers – and the same ones – in their homes.
- The initiatives targeted at the individual citizen to improve care should be based on the working method called the PDSA circle (Plan-Do-Study-Act), which was used in the experiments.

3.5 Implementation

The interviews were conducted at the start of phase 2 of the project. Phase 2 is essentially an implementation phase of Erantis, where the recommendations from phase 1 are implemented across the municipality. However, phase 2 also involves an explicit development dimension in the form of two learning circles that, contrary to phase 1, also directly involves the users. The focus is on cooperation between the elder care system and the users (citizens).

Phase 2 started in June 2022 and will continue until December 2023. The core in this phase of Erantis is eight geographical areas (the geo-teams, each with a minimum of 10 employees). Furthermore, to support the implementation, further training of management and staff will take place – the major part of the phase 2 budget of approximately 1.2 million euro will be used for this task and all employees in a team will undertake a five-day course to learn how to cooperate with each other.

3.6 Results and effects so far

As Erantis has just reached its implementation phase, a full-scale evaluation is premature. However, it is possible to point to observations from the interviewees and other sources.

The project indicates new form of management. That the teams are supposed to be self-governing reduces and changes management roles – but does not remove them. It has been a challenge for both managers and employees to adapt to these new circumstances. Still, with one notable exception, the interviews

found that management as well as employees are generally committed to Erantis and – at least to some extent – find it plausible that the project will fulfil at least some of its main aims. A hope for Erantis phase 2 is that the new form of work organization will reduce recruitment problems, although according to one of the interviewees this does not so far seem to be the case. Another aim and hoped for effect is that sickness absence will be reduced due to both greater job satisfaction from working in self-governing teams and employees only working with citizens they know well in the geo-teams.

Despite this general commitment, a number of concrete challenges were mentioned during the interviews. Just as in the other LTC-case, interviewees reported that some employees felt overwhelmed by the numerous Erantis activities. This challenge relates to the balance between daily activities and development efforts, as one interviewee described it. The recruitment challenges increased the difficulty in committing staff to development efforts such as Erantis.

Another challenge mentioned was that some employees were unclear about what they had signed up to in participating in the learning circles. This might reflect the fact that most employees previously worked under detailed directives and time-management systems, and in Erantis suddenly find that they have to work under different and more loose governance structures.

Some employees decided to leave the project because of these challenges, whereas others lost their initial scepticism during the process. In addition, pressure from Covid-19 – including increased sickness absence - contributed to a situation where some employees were reluctant to involve themselves in additional tasks.

No substantial conflicts or cooperation difficulties between the actors were mentioned in the interviews. Tensions between management and the trade unions have so far been limited. However, one of the interviewees foresaw that the trade unions will be challenged later in the process because the project will demand more flexible working time than usual. Another interviewee reported tensions between the nurses' trade union and management in the early phase of the project. It is also notable that the general secretary of the DNO, in a joint letter with the chair of DNO's regional Central Jutland department in January 2020, was sceptical towards the Buurtzorg model. Among other features, the authors questioned the strong marketization dimension in the Buurtzorg model, its lack of professional leadership, legal obstacles to fully implementing the model in Denmark and anticipated problems for the small teams in delivering a 24-hour service (Christensen og Laursen 2020).

Moreover, two reflections can be made, partly drawing on interview statements. One is about the transferability of the model that inspired the project, the Buurtzorg model. There are important differences between the country where the model originated (the Netherlands) and Denmark with regards to LTC. In Denmark, trade unions have a stronger role and a higher organizational density than in the Netherlands. Furthermore, marketization has a more limited role in Danish LTC, and the labour market participation (measured in working hours) of women is higher. All this might have affected the effort to

use the Buurtzorg model in a Danish context. However, Erantis has developed from a completely Burtzorg-inspired project to one with its own identity.

Second, according to an interviewee with long tenure in the municipality Erantis can also be viewed as a return to a form of work organization from some years ago, when LTC in the municipality was organized in smaller units with closer contact to citizens, closer cooperation between the occupations involved and - according to an interviewee – a low level of sickness absence. The small units and cross-occupational approach were abandoned in order to create economics of scale, and the occupations were split into different categories to secure a higher level of professionalism within each of them.

Finally, the findings from an evaluation report on Erantis published in June 2022 by the Danish Center for Social Science Research (VIVE) should be mentioned (Buch og Topholm 2022). The evaluation finds, first, a relatively large readiness among employees for the changes centred on geo-teams. Second, there is a wish for a form of work organization that supports continuity as well as knowledge sharing across occupational groups. There are expectations that the learning created through experiments is taken into account in the rollout of geo-teams. Third, the participants had to get used to the experiments, but these developed into well-functioning development spaces. Most participants learned to reflect on their own practice and on opportunities for improvement, and gradually felt safe in these development spaces. Fourth, it is the local implementation of the legislation, rather than the legislation itself, which has presented challenges. Examples include the municipality's existing organization with professional groups in separate silos, each with its own budget and management, and the existing practice of primarily using written documentation for knowledge sharing.

Based on these observations, the evaluators point to three areas that need attention: Regarding occupational cooperation, it will be important to find a sustainable model for cooperation between the home care/nursing geo-teams and the associated functions – visitation, assistive therapists and rehabilitation therapists. With regard to the geo-teams themselves, a sustainable structure for meetings and knowledge sharing related to geo-teams should be found. In the municipality, the evaluators found a tendency to reproduce an existing time-consuming approach to meetings and knowledge sharing. Regarding resources, the available personnel resources should be clarified. Many employees expressed project and Covid-19 fatigue, and demanded clear plans and announcements for additional work well ahead of time. This should be seen in the light of frustrations associated with carrying out the project at a time when it was not possible to call in extra temps.

4. ECEC case: Recruitment and retention initiatives in the City of Copenhagen

This case study focuses on a collective agreement including wage pools for the recruitment and retention of educational staff in the municipality of Copenhagen. The case was chosen to exemplify how local actors use the Danish employment relations system to find solutions to staffing requirements, i.e., improving coverage, and how this interacts with budgetary challenges, working conditions and/or improvement of service quality.

The collective agreement studied here was concluded between the City of Copenhagen's Children and Youth Services (BUF), the National Association of Social Pedagogues (LFS) and the local Early Childhood Educators' Association (BUPL Hovedstaden), and was signed by the parties on 16 December 2021.

4.1 The local context

The City of Copenhagen is by far the largest municipality in Denmark with approximately 650,000 citizens – and it is growing. The municipality employs more than 40,000 people and is the second largest public sector workplace in Denmark. The government of the city includes the supreme body – the City Council – and seven rather independent standing political committees, each served by their own administration and with their own mayor. BUF is the administration serving the political committee (currently led by a Liberal Conservative Mayor) with the responsibility for schools, ECEC, youth, and also includes care for children and youngsters with special needs.

The most recent budget process in 2022 for the City of Copenhagen involved a balancing of investments in welfare and green solutions, while also providing tax cuts. In the budget agreement for 2022 a number of investments were also agreed upon, targeting children and youth services. Among others, a three-digit million amount was set aside to develop Copenhagen's primary school, more trained pedagogues and a strengthened management in the city's nurseries and day care centres. Moreover, funds were set aside for recruitment purposes as explained in more detail below.

4.2 The case study and problems to be solved

Within ECEC, recruitment and retention have become a salient issue as a result of the politically set minimum staffing requirements that are necessary to improve service coverage across the country.

In the municipal Budget 2022, funds totaling 10 million euro were set aside every year for four years to address recruitment and retention challenges in selected welfare areas, including the ECEC sector. In the local administration of BUF, the fund was approximately 2.8 million euro. This political agreement was instrumental for the collective bargaining process. For local trade unions the political agreement was also seen as a positive response to their wage strategy.

4.3 Actors involved and their positions

In this case, the actors are the traditional local employment relations actors.

Representing management is the administration of Copenhagen Municipality's BUF. BUPL Hovedstaden represents pedagogues and is the local BUPL union branch in the capital. Also, the LFS represents groups of educated pedagogues as well as pedagogical assistants and day carers in the ECEC sector. LFS is part of FOA and, as described in the WP1/2 report, also represents large groups within ECEC, namely, pedagogical assistants and day care workers. FOA have previously documented that their member groups (especially among the unskilled pedagogical assistants) are less successful in obtaining wage bonuses at the local level.

Local unions within the City of Copenhagen representing different groups of staff across care sectors had, for a period, a wage strategy of combining the issue of gender unequal wages with the more recent question of staff recruitment.

4.4 The process and result

BUPL Hovedstaden and LFS collaborated in the bargaining process from the beginning. Since funding was already secured, the negotiations were experienced as constructive and rather easy by all parties. The unions had three aims: First, to retain educated staff, especially, for longer; second, to generally stop staff from fleeing the municipality; and third, to express appreciation for existing staff. BUF was also interested in retaining educated staff. Wage levels are relatively good among educated ECEC staff in the City of Copenhagen, so it was important for BUF that wage supplements were considered in relation to other wage elements – for instance, the retention supplement would be given when wage development otherwise slowed down over the career. The reasoning was to secure the maximum effect from wage supplements. BUF also saw an advantage in promoting recruitment and retention among recently educated staff.

The collective agreement included two measures that addressed recruitment and retention, respectively. The *recruitment measure* involved a one-off supplement of approximately 2,000 euro to each newly qualified pedagogue after six months of continuous employment in a permanent position. The *retention measure* involved a similar one-off supplement of approximately 2,000 euro to fully trained pedagogues who had a minimum of eight years of uninterrupted employment in the Municipality of Copenhagen.

Furthermore, the agreement contained a number of initiatives aimed at retaining senior staff. This included a mandatory individual interview between the manager and the senior staff member, a senior position for pedagogues aged 60 and above, a temporary scheme including a right to a reduction of 17 in working hours of minutes per week for senior pedagogues aged 55–57 resulting in approximately two working days (BUF 2021). Among the few obstacles that needed to be tackled during bargaining was how to best supplement the senior rights already established in the sector collective agreement.

4.5 Discussion and evaluation

After the agreement was concluded, a number of other municipalities introduced similar models or found other ways to use local wages as a

recruitment tool. Lyngby-Taarbæk is one of the municipalities that has also introduced a one-off salary bonus. Egedal Municipality chose a different model with a general salary increase of 67 euro per month for all pedagogues in the municipality. Elsinore municipality chose a third model, with a higher starting salary level for pedagogues (according to one interviewee).

Municipalities neighbouring the City of Copenhagen have criticized the initiatives, arguing that they introduce wage competition and that recruitment challenges are rooted in a structural problem with a shortage of educators, which cannot be solved by individual municipalities trying to attract educators from neighboring municipalities using salary bonuses (A4 2022). BUF has justified the salary supplements, arguing that the cost of living in Copenhagen is higher than in many other municipalities and that since the salary level for pedagogues in Copenhagen was relatively high compared to several other municipalities – even before the agreement – there is nothing new in a higher salary level in Copenhagen.

Several interviewees within the City of Copenhagen also stress that high professionalism, good working environments etc. are equally important for recruitment and retention. Thus, they find it difficult to discern what unique effect wage supplements have in relation to other working conditions. The wage models created in the local agreement in the City of Copenhagen was chosen in order to target recruitment and retention in relation to specific groups. However, it is still too early to say anything about the effect of this employment relations initiative, the first part of which was only evaluated in autumn 2022. This evaluation will also focus on whether all the funds have been spent and, if not, negotiations will be reinitiated.

5. ECEC case: Experimenting to improve service quality in day care in Elsinore municipality

This second ECEC case study focuses on experiments with enhancing quality in ECEC in Elsinore municipality. The case is an example of how staff requirements and service quality interact, and it represents an example of the tradition of union involvement in innovative processes in Danish welfare systems.

5.1 The local context

Elsinore Municipality lies within the Copenhagen Capital Region in the northern part of Zealand in Eastern Denmark. The municipality has about 63,000 citizens. The current mayor represents the Conservative People's Party.

The local budget agreement for 2022 meant that the municipality would cut 5 million euro and in 2023 just over 6 million euro. These cuts are mainly driven by increased budgetary expenses due to an ageing population, loss of workforce (i.e., taxes), increased spending on elder care and high expenses for citizens with special needs. The budget cuts are widely dispersed, and will also affect the price of ECEC services somewhat, but they do not entail reductions in coverage.

5.2 The case study and problems to be resolved

As part of the third round of experiments with creating more freedom and less bureaucracy for municipalities, i.e., 'Frikommuneforsøg', the Danish government entered into welfare agreements with two municipalities in 2020, exempting them from the majority of state regulation concerning ECEC – namely, the Day Care Act. Elsinore was one of two municipalities chosen by government to participate in these experiments. The welfare agreements emphasize that the two municipalities can deviate from both state and municipal rules to the widest possible extent during a three-year trial period (July 2021–September 2024) in order to find new, smart ways of carrying out welfare tasks locally. Moreover, the agreements stipulate that municipalities should refrain from replacing governmental regulation with local regulations.

The overall purpose of the experiments is to test new ways of doing things in the day care sector, enabling more quality for the same money, more time for core welfare in the municipalities and to strengthen professional discretion. The learning from the experiments is intended to inspire simplification and improvement of state regulations in general. Moreover, the welfare agreement emphasizes the importance of focusing on enhancing welfare services for citizens and on including citizens in the processes.

However, concerning both national and municipal regulation, a smaller number of rules are safeguarded. From national legislation this includes, for instance, the overall aim of the Day Care Act, the rules stipulating local government responsibility for providing day care services and the remuneration rights for care and parental payments. At local level, the municipality of Elsinore, among others, also decided to safeguard the new rules concerning

minimum staffing requirements in day care. Moreover, the inclusion of citizens – mainly parents – remains a high priority.

5.3 The actors involved

The municipal council, including the mayor, set goals and direction for the work on the welfare agreement and also decided which municipal rules to safeguard from the experiments. During this process the local disability council (Handicapråd), parental boards and staff were all consulted on the matter. The staff consultation took place through the formal cooperative committee system.

In line with the intention of the welfare agreements and local political priorities, citizens (i.e., parents) were also invited into the process early on, and were able to make suggestions about the process and point to needs in relation to enhancing service quality.

The steering committee for the municipal implementation of the welfare agreement – i.e., the municipal project in its entirety – includes the mayor, the chair of the political committee for children and education, the chief administrative officer of the municipality, three chiefs of staff within the ECEC sector and a consultant. A project follow-up group has also been established including representatives of the local unions, BUPL and FOA. In addition, an advisory board including external professionals and experts on ECEC services as well as union representatives has been created with the aim of offering feedback and promoting an innovative approach to the projects.

5.4 The process

The initial stages of the process were much affected by the Covid-19 situation and most interaction with larger groups of citizens and staff took place online. According to interviewees, this had with no negative effects.

In May 2021, Elsinore city council set the goals and direction for the work on the welfare agreement. The goals were based on the municipality's Vision 2030 for the ECEC area of 0–6-year-old children, and included (translated from the project web page):

- In cohesion, the municipality will develop creative and innovative learning environments that stimulate curiosity and immersion.
- In cohesion, the municipality will develop high-quality day care and schools that strengthen the well-being, learning, development and education of all children and young people.
- Children brought up in Elsinore municipality must be able to speak age-appropriate and varied Danish when they come to school, so that the proportion of children who do not need special language learning amounts to 95%.
- All children and young people must feel like they are a valuable part of the community.

In all, the political process lasted about eight months. As mentioned above, the local branches of BUPL and FOA were formally consulted at this early stage alongside a few other organizations and parents' boards. The unions

emphasized the importance of pedagogues and pedagogue assistants being 'freed' from rules, and thus given a real opportunity to test what works and what doesn't work in relation to enhancing service quality. The local unions were from the outset represented in the project's follow-up group.

After the formal decision was taken by Elsinore city council, a number of virtual kick-off meetings were also held in May 2021, involving politicians, parents' boards, managers and staff in the local day care centres. Implementation of the welfare agreement gained high political attention in the municipality. Moreover, politicians prioritized the engagement of citizens and parents' boards in the first kick-off meetings.

In June 2021, the local unions BUPL and FOA in North Zealand held a collective members meeting to inform about the project and provide for discussion on employees' wishes and desires, suggestions for projects and a general discussion on what service quality in ECEC entails.

From the outset, the municipal administration in the form of the Center for Day Care, Leisure and Sports has kept a dynamic log book of the initiatives created in (so far) 14 of the 26 day care institutions in the municipality. The log book is regularly updated in collaboration with managers of the individual day care centres and provides an overview of all initiatives. Dialogue with staff is also planned for future visits at the local day care centres. The log book will be part of the final evaluation of the experiments.

5.5 The results and evaluation

The municipal administration has emphasized that the steering chain has been reversed in this project, leaving the initiative for innovation and development in the hands of local actors at individual day care institutions. Moreover, this reversion has had consequences for the role of municipal and local management, namely, that management now has less focus on steering and more on exercising professional leadership.

The local initiatives and innovative thinking also appears to be positively perceived by staff. The local unions note several instances of strong collaboration between local management, shop stewards and staff in creating and implementing local initiatives in the day care centres.

For this report, interviews were conducted with management and a local shop steward representing one of the local day care centres. As an example of a local experiment, this day care facility hired an additional pedagogue – an 'immersion educator' – who works across the whole centre, emphasizing 'deep' or 'immersed' learning. In contrast to consultants, who are employed on a temporary basis, the immersion educator is responsible for creating continuity in educational work. The immersion educator focuses on the quality of the educational work in daily collaboration with staff and in close dialogue with management. Spending two weeks with each group of children, carrying out observation and reflection as well as initiating play, the immersion educator improves relations with the children and around the activity in collaboration with staff, and helps permanent staff to enhance quality in their educational tasks with the children. Permanent staff are responsible for coming up with a theme that the immersion educator is to focus on.

According to interviewees, the immersion educator is considered a success in enhancing quality. This extra member of staff is not part of achieving the minimum standard per se, but is partly enabled due to the retention of budgetary means for recruitment. However, the initiative could have been taken within the existing legislative framework regulating the ECEC area. Except for one or two initiatives, most of the 14 local day care centres' initiatives could, according to the interviewees, similarly have been done within the existing legislative framework. Initiating this large-scale experimentation with its emphasis on local initiatives appears to have released creativity and innovation, but it does not clearly hint at any need for legislative changes.

There is no indication that these initiatives have had negative consequences for wages and working conditions. To enhance the recruitment of educated staff, Elsinore has chosen to place recently educated pedagogues on a higher salary level. Thus, the recruitment challenges and the fact that budgetary resources enabling recruitment appear to correlate positively with initiatives for enhancing service quality. In itself, recruitment improves coverage, but does not necessarily improve quality.

However, the results of the projects have not been fully documented as the experiments have not yet been completed or evaluated. The Danish Center for Social Science Research (VIVE) are to evaluate the projects initiated in connection with the welfare agreements. VIVE's pre-evaluation conducted in 2021–2022, which surveyed staff and managers views on the quality of the initiatives and the means to improve service quality in their service area, stated that this is the most far-reaching experiment to date in releasing social services from rules and regulations (VIVE 2022). VIVE is planning to publish a mid-term report on the preliminary results in 2022, and at the end of 2024 the final evaluation on the welfare agreements will be published. The case of Elsinore municipality will be part of the evaluation.

6. Comparing the four cases – what to learn from them?

6.1 The content of cases

The four cases presented above all include innovative actions or forms of experimentation targeted at *recruitment and retention* of care staff. Moreover, the cases, to a varying degree, also address issues concerning *workload* (work intensification) and *service quality* at local level. These three issues have proven to be of particular importance in the ECEC and LTC sectors in Denmark at central sector level.

- The Herning case exemplifies a wide variety of initiatives taken to enhance recruitment and retention of staff to the LTC sector at local level. The case includes initiatives targeted at enlarging the labour force by, for instance, recruitment of foreign labour and upskilling of local labour. Moreover, the case includes a number of initiatives targeted at retaining existing staff and reducing educational dropout rates, i.e., an educational strategy.
- The Ikast-Brande case involves work reorganization including the introduction of self-governing teams inspired by Dutch experiences. The project aims to strengthen the focus on user needs, enhance user satisfaction and work satisfaction and strengthen service quality.
- The case of the City of Copenhagen exemplifies how local actors use the Danish ER system to find solutions to staffing requirements, i.e., improving coverage. More specifically, the case focuses on a collective agreement including wage pools for the recruitment and retention of educational staff in the Municipality of Copenhagen and how this interacts with budgetary challenges, working conditions and/or improvement of service quality.
- The Elsinore case focuses on the experiments conducted in ECEC in Elsinore municipality following a welfare agreement with central government that enabled the municipality to deviate from both state and municipal rules during a three-year trial period to find new, smart ways of carrying out welfare tasks within the municipal budgetary framework. The case is also an example of how staff requirements and service quality can interact.

Thus, the Herning and City of Copenhagen cases represent local initiatives in local LTC and ECEC, respectively, but both have a strong focus on recruitment and retention. Comparing the two cases, the diversity and number of initiatives taken in LTC in the Herning case stand out, while the ECEC case represented in the City of Copenhagen is a case of strong ER actor involvement. The two cases also differ significantly concerning the number and types of actors involved.

The Ikast-Brande case representing local LTC and the Elsinore case representing local ECEC are two very different cases, but both target service quality and also involve aspects of recruitment. Furthermore, both cases represent an example of the tradition of union involvement in innovative processes in Danish welfare systems while simultaneously demonstrating that, when it comes to enhancing service quality, user involvement and other actors often take precedence.

Within each case, the role of the social partners and of ER institutions is especially in focus. Moreover, the cases address how policy choices are influenced by possible budget constraints or investments.

6.2 The budgetary context for the cases

Across the cases, the budgetary context is a key factor that has changed over time. Because of the financial crisis that hit Denmark in 2008, the public sector experienced (comparatively mild) austerity, especially in the form of increasing budgetary constraints on the municipalities from 2009 onwards. This created strong incentives for the individual municipality to avoid budgetary deficits. From 2011 onwards, especially, there was local austerity pressure on care services, although with great variation between municipalities.

From 2007 to 2013, municipalities had significantly larger budget deviations than in the period 2014 to 2019, marked by budgetary surpluses rather than deficits. Larger budget deviation occurred again in 2020 and 2021, but the figures are uncertain due to Covid-19 (Jensen & Pedersen 2022).

The four cases analyzed represent four municipalities with rather well-balanced budgets, but with also differences in opportunities and priorities. Comparing the two ECEC cases, the budget for the City of Copenhagen includes increased spending in ECEC and funds for recruitment, while the budget in Elsinore entails widely dispersed budget cuts resulting in an increase in the price of ECEC services but with no reduction in service coverage. Comparing the two LTC cases, the 2022 budgets in both Ikast-Brande and Herning municipalities include an increase in the budgets for elder care compared to the previous year.

Across the four case municipalities, the overall financial context thus appears to have moved from a time when municipalities were challenged by budgetary restraints to a time where they are challenged by recruitment difficulties and the lack of a workforce for care, but are also able to increase spending moderately.

6.3 Actors, arenas and influence

In three of the four cases – the Herning, Ikast-Brande and Elsinore cases - the municipality is *the* main actor; it has initiated the cases and has the upper hand in steering them. The strongest role of the municipality in these three cases is the role as public authority rather than as public employer. The three cases are mainly placed in the political–administrative decision-making arena.

The fourth case – the City of Copenhagen – is different in these regards. The municipality public employer role is in this case stronger than its role as a public authority, and it is the only case mainly placed in the collective bargaining decision-making arena. This also implies that the municipality is not *the* main actor in this case, but shares the ‘top position’ with the relevant trade unions, i.e., the local branch of BUPL and the National Association of Social Pedagogues, which is part of FOA. The unions’ stronger role in this case reflects that they are bargaining partners with the municipality, whereas the municipality merely consulted the unions in the other three cases.

Importantly, consultation is not always equal to weak influence, and in some cases it can be a path to strong influence and partnership. However, in the Herning, Ikast-Brande and Elsinore cases this is not the situation. In the ‘multi-layered’ Herning case, at least one of the initiatives is discussed repeatedly in the bipartite Cooperation Council, and the relevant trade unions – mostly FOA and The Danish Nurses Organization, DNO – are involved in specific intervention areas and experiments on an ad hoc basis. Their roles include both exchange of ideas and watchdog functions related to labour law issues. In the Ikast-Brande case – which partly focuses on debureaucratization but nevertheless itself has three governing bodies – the trade unions are involved in the project’s steering committee and have shown a strong interest in the project; tensions with the other actors are reported to be low. In the Elsinore case, the trade unions were consulted in the early phase of the initiative alongside a few other organizations and they are represented in the follow-up group. The bipartite Cooperation Council is also involved. Common to all three cases is that although the trade unions have a role to play and deliver important inputs in some respects, they are not among the most important actors.

With regard to other actors, educational institutions are key, not least in the SOSU education focused initiative in the Herning ‘multi-case’. Other actors seem to have only demarcated or minor roles. These include users and their organizations that are involved in several of the cases, covering parent boards, councils for those with disabilities, councils for elderly people and individual elderly. In the Elsinore case, for instance, the municipality introduced citizen involvement in the early stages of the project – and prior to the involvement of the trade unions. Finally, a municipal jobcentre, an agricultural job-broker consultancy and a language school have minor roles in the Herning case.

6.4 Governance

This section focuses on two dimensions of governance: The cases’ connection to the national level (regarding initiation, financing and degree of decentralization) and the implications of the cases for management at the local level.

All the cases are, of course, linked to the national level in that the services they deliver, the administrative set-up of the municipalities and local level industrial relations are embedded in national structures (see the Danish WP1-2 report). However, the cases can be divided into two when it comes to further linkages to the national level on the three above-mentioned dimensions.

The Ikast-Brande case was initiated locally, but financed by national ministerial funds, which could imply that in addition to the ideas and priorities of local actors, these actors’ reading of the national actors’ call for applications also played a role. The case does not involve any decentralization or other changes in regulation related to the case’s link to the national level.

Regarding its links to the national level, the Elsinore case is different from the Ikast-Brande case. The frikomunne-forsøg was formulated at the national level and government chose the Elsinore municipality as one of several applicants to participate in the pilot. The case was thus initiated at the national level. Moreover, it has a strong decentralization dimension. Being part of the

‘frikommuneforsøg’ sets – as described above – the municipality is free of some regulatory frameworks, although other rules are safeguarded.

The other two cases – the Herning and City of Copenhagen cases – do not have such direct links with the national level. They were initiated by local actors as a response to mainly local challenges and funded by the municipalities’ budgets.

With regard to changes in the management relations at the local level, the Ikast-Brande case includes these as one of its aims. In the development phase of the case, far more decisions than usual in elder care were left to the employees. Also, in the implementation phase, decision-making will be relatively decentralized, as the core role of the self-governing teams illustrates. In this way, the professional judgement of employees in the various occupations will be more important and the role of middle management reduced.

Similar changes are part of the Elsinore case, where fewer rules bind local actors and the initiative for innovative actions are left to them and individual day care institutions. This appears to release management at higher levels from traditional steering tasks and leave more time to focus on leadership based on the professions.

Also in the Herning case, experiments within loose steering structures are part of the initiative, although these might play a less dominant role than in the Ikast-Brande and Elsinore cases. Whether the experiments in the Herning case will also have implications for local management is not clear. The City of Copenhagen case does not include changes in local management.

6.5 Learning across cases

All the innovative actions and experiments found in the four cases are very recent and in the process of being implemented. Thus, none of the cases can be evaluated as yet. Nevertheless, preliminary learning concerning the context, the different processes, and actor involvement in the four cases can be extracted.

The budgetary context varies for the four cases but, across cases, the selected municipalities have made (moderate) investments in both LTC and ECEC locally in connection with the initiation of the many projects. In both the LTC and ECEC cases, investments appear to facilitate the policy choices made, especially for solving recruitment challenges and retention.

In the LTC cases, initiatives are manifold and involves a multitude of actors, whereas initiatives are fewer in the ECEC cases and involve fewer actors. Across the two LTC cases, unions and employees have received the initiatives well, but some workplaces also expressed concern with being burdened with too many activities.

Local actors positively link the initiatives taken for enhancing recruitment and retention to enhancing service quality, but all actors concur that there is no straightforward causality and that further innovative thinking and initiatives are necessary for service quality to be improved, especially if budgetary investments remain moderate.

Moreover, from two of the cases within the ECEC and LTC sector, respectively, we find examples of initiatives to enhance service quality being moved to the forefront of service delivery, i.e., the individual day care centre

and elder care unit. This decentralization appears to have direct consequences for the governance structures, especially for the experiences of management. Local management finds in several of the cases that inverting the initiative and governance structure leaves more space for local management to focus on leadership and professional judgements.

Furthermore, the processes in the four cases entail close dialogue between management, staff and local shop stewards. Social partners perceive this involvement as important and positive in all four cases. The formal Cooperation Committee plays an important role in involving employee representatives early on in the process.

However, there are also important differences in terms of the actors involved across the cases. The City of Copenhagen case takes place in the collective bargaining arena, and uniquely displays the strong role of unions and the role of government employer taken by the municipal management in this arena. The other three cases, which take place in the political-administrative arena, display a much larger variety of actors involved in the recruitment and retention initiatives and those targeted at enhancing service quality. Hence, the municipalities are, in general, the main actors shaping the initiatives. While the municipalities involve employees and unions, they often play a secondary role which is not always larger than the users and their organizations, independent experts and other local actors.

References

A4 (2022): Borgmestre kritiserer kommuners lønbonus til pædagoger. A4 overenskomst, 17. januar.

Buch, M. S. og E. H.-E. Topholm (2022): Ikast-Brande Kommunes 'eratisprojekt'- opsamling af læring, oplevede resultater og opmærksomhedspunkter. København: VIVE.

BUF (2021): Aftale om rekruttering og fastholdelse af pædagoger i BUF. Af 12. december 2021.

Christensen, G. og A. Lauersen (2022): Gambl ikke med syge borgere og medarbejderes faglighed og trivsel. <https://dsr.dk/kredse/midtjylland/nyhed/gambl-ikke-med-syge-borgere-og-medarbejderes-faglighed-og-trivsel>

Herning Kommune (2019): Strategi for rekruttering af Social- og Sundheds (SOSU)-personale til Sundhed og Ældre frem mod 2030.

Social og Sundhedsskolen Herning et al. (2019): Strategi – Rekruttering og fastholdelse af elever på social- og sundhedsuddannelserne.

Social og Sundhedsskolen Herning et al. (2020): Fælles kvalitetsaftale.

STAR (2022): Rekrutteringssurvey. Rapport, september 2022. København: STAR.

Annex A – List of interviewees

All interviewees have received a draft of the report to comment on.

Anne Christmann Ramsgaard, Director for Health and Elderly, Herning municipality

Lisbeth Munk, recruitment consultant in Health and Elderly, Herning municipality

Louise Theilgaard Nikolajsen, development consultant in Health and Elderly, Herning municipality

Kirsten Nørrelykke, joint shop steward for FOA and SOSU-assistant on Engholm Care Center

Helle Hager, District Head of Home Help, Herning municipality

Karen Heebøll, Cross Director, Ikast-Brande municipality

Dorthe Jepsen, Director og Helath and Elderly and project owner of project Erantis, Ikast-Brande municipality

Heidi Bach Henriksen, shop steward FOA/SOSU helper in Hjemmeplejen Nord

Diana Langhoff Jensen, Director in Hjemmeplejen Nord

Dorthe Iversen, project leader in project Erantis

Magnus Herold Gudmundsson, lawyer and consultant, FOA

Nina Hemmersam, head of Centre for politics and HR in the Administration of Children and Youth Services (BUF), City of Copenhagen

Henriette Brockdorff, Negotiator and chair of BUPL Hovedstaden (City of Copenhagen)

Nicki Rich Justenborg, Shop steward (LFS), the day care institution Rosa, City of Copenhagen

Jacob Skovlod Nielsen, Manager of the day care institution Rosa, City of Copenhagen

Hanne Nøddekær, Consultant in the Centre for day care, schools and leisure (DSFI), Elsinore

Vibeke Stær Juul, joint shop steward (BUPL), Elsinore

Henriette Kofoed Heller, shop steward (BUPL), Børnehuset Søbæk, Elsinore

Henrik Groth, Manager Børnehuset Søbæk, Elsinore